

# Thomas Memorial Library Study Committee

Minutes of meeting: Thursday, May 15, 2008 @ 6:30 P.M.

## In Attendance:

Nancy Marshall, *Chair*  
Ed Nadeau, *Secretary*  
Robert Chatfield, Penny Olsen, and Nancy O'Sullivan  
Norman R. Jordan  
Jay Scherma, *Library Director*

## Representing:

TML Board of Trustees  
CE Historical Society  
Thomas Memorial Library

## Absent:

Evan Roth and Pat Bredenberg  
Anne Swift-Kayatta  
Ellie Vuilleumier

TML Board of Trustees  
CE Town Council  
TML Foundation

## Approve minutes:

- Meeting minutes of April 17, 2008 approved.
- The minutes of the consultant selection meeting, held on May 8th are forthcoming and will be subject to approval at our next meeting.

## Old Business:

### A. Consultant Selection discussion (continued from May 8th)

- In addition to the 3 consulting groups we interviewed, a fourth alternative was considered: Reject all bids and create a hybrid team made up of a library consultants and an architect from 2 different groups that we interviewed. Jay discussed the wisdom of this approach with the Town Manager. We are advised to: "weigh the relative merits of each proposal. What is more important, the architectural firm or the library consultant firm? How does cost factor in? I discourage you from trying to arrange a marriage..... It is my strong recommendation that the committee settle on one proposal. "
- The groups interviewed have worked together on other projects. How well did they work together? Was the client satisfied? Anne checked references and provided the following report:

---

### Himmel and Wilson Proposal

#### On Himmel & Wilson:

1. *Carlton Sears, Youngstown, OH:*  
*Has used H&W 3 times (for long range planning, inc. focus groups; capital planning; and staff issues) and will use again. Has not done a building with them. He is doing 2 buildings now, using local architects, but is not familiar with Casaccio or Design Group. H&W have become his personal friends. Great to work with; no weaknesses he can think of.*
2. *Alice Neve, St. Paul, MN Public Library: phone number given is not in service*
3. *Linda Rice, Bosler Memorial Library, Carlisle, PA: we have played phone tag and not yet connected.*

# Thomas Memorial Library Study Committee

Minutes of meeting: Thursday, May 15, 2008 @ 6:30 P.M.

## On **Casaccio Architects**:

1. *William Connor, Easttown, PA Library Project: Very happy with Casaccio. Has not worked with H&W. Built a new building in historic community; building fit the town. Casaccio is good to work with. Did not work with Kevin Whitney on the library, but is working with him on a fire house. A good firm.*
2. *Peggy Mahan, Easttown, PA Library: Did a total new building. Casaccio are good listeners; good to work with. Perhaps not great on creativity, but quality was great. Love the new building: contemporary building that fits historical town context. Worked a little with Kevin Whitney. Lee Casaccio did interior design; good experience with him.*
3. *Rebecca Sammartino, Glenn Mills, PA: Phone number given is not the library.*

## On **Design Group**:

1. *Steve Prater, Columbus, OH Metropolitan Library: Phone number given has been disconnected.*
2. *Don Barlow, Westerville, OH Public Library: An independent library. He has done two projects with DG: an addition and a renovation. Did not work with a library consultant, just DG. (Though he said that H&W, coincidentally, had just visited his library to check it out because they had heard of it; not because of any project.) DG understands libraries. They analyzed needs and did drawings. Jack Hedge is great; he has done Jacksonville, FL and lots of OH libraries. His library is part of an historic district. DG good to work with; great interior designers. General (not DG) caution: be careful when you wire your library.*
3. *Jane Dayton, Carnegie Library of Pittsburgh, PA: left message; no answer.*

## J. Stewart Roberts Proposal

1. *Patricia Immen, Concord, NH Library: Did similar project to ours—April-October 2007. Scope: describe community; get community input, including community leaders and focus groups (with Nolan Lushington); track national trends; do new mission statement; evaluated current facilities; do space needs analysis; determine library building program; develop options to present to City Council. Conclusion: should do new library building downtown; looking for land to buy now and build in 1012; have not yet selected an architect. (They also had interviewed Aaron Cohen but did not pick them.)*

*Mixed reviews on experience with JSR and Nolan Lushington. JSR was prompt, responsive, good with City Council; she's pleased with him. Nolan Lushington knows a lot about libraries, but was not always prepared and his finished product quality was uneven. She feels he put back on her and her staff work that he should have done, so she has mixed feelings about him.*

*She knows that Randy Brough of the Laconia, NH Library worked with JSR and was happy with him. Laconia did not work with Lushington.*

2. *Joe Sangiovanni, Suffield, CT Public Library: phone number given is not in service.*
3. *Betsy Pohl, Lithgow Public Library, Augusta, ME: Liked JSR very much. He updated their schematic design. They got 7 proposals; interviewed 4 (including Barba Associates); picked JSR. Stew looked at their old design and updated it; updated building program; worked with building committee to translate needs into new schematic; gave options for building.*

## Thomas Memorial Library Study Committee

Minutes of meeting: Thursday, May 15, 2008 @ 6:30 P.M.

*They got a computer model, floor plans, site plans, and a 3D model. Stew met 3-4 times with the committee and helped present to City Council. He is very professional, easy to work with, knowledgeable regarding libraries, interested in historic preservation, and a good listener. She is going to be working with him again since the Augusta Library bond failed and they need to downsize their proposal to try again. She has no concerns/negatives on Stew.*

*She did not work with Nolan Lushington on this project, but she did work with him in 1999 to do a needs assessment and thought he was good. She has not worked with H&W though is somewhat familiar with them from conferences. In 2001, she worked with Jay Lucker, a building consultant.*

---

- Nancy Marshall contacted Bill Wilson (Himmel & Wilson) to determine the need of 2 architectural firms on the team, and the cost implications if one could be eliminated without loss of quality. Bill assured Nancy that Jack Hedge (Design Group) work, though necessary, did not have to be done by a separate firm. This work will be done by H&W, but mostly Kevin Whitney (Cassacio) at a lower rate. The impact of this change will reduce cost. Bill also indicated that the technical services of Linda Miller will be part of the team at no extra cost.
- Himmel & Wilson revised their bid \$80,000.
- Ed contacted Bill Wilson (Himmel & Wilson) to obtain a breakdown of hours by team member and phase in order to complete a meaningful comparison to Providence and J. Stewart Gardiner consulting teams. H&W also provided revised (reduced) hourly rates data for all team members. (see Comparative Evaluation spreadsheet attached)
- Jay, Nancy & Ed met to review the data provided and decided to make one more attempt to reduce the price. We contacted H&W with the following message:  
*"During the interview you suggested we could consolidate the focus groups into fewer days than originally planned, thereby reducing cost. Do you see this as a means to further reduce the fee? Is there anything else that we should consider before asking you for a final bid to put before the committee?"*
- Himmel & Wilson revised their bid \$75,000.
- The merits of each of the 3 consultant groups were revisited.
- **Motion:** To recommend Himmel & Wilson to the Town Manager as the consultant to assist the TML Study Committee with the needs assessment and design concept study.  
**Result:** Unanimously approved.
- Nancy M. and Jay will prepare a letter to inform the Town Manager of our recommendation.
- The chair will notify Himmel & Wilson of our decision to recommend them to the Town Manager.
- The secretary will prepare and send letters to inform Providence and J. Stewart Roberts of our decision to recommend Himmel & Wilson to the Town Manager.

## **Thomas Memorial Library Study Committee**

**Minutes of meeting: Thursday, May 15, 2008 @ 6:30 P.M.**

- **Motion:** To make a formal request to the TML Foundation to fund the needs assessment and design concept study in whole or in part.  
**Result:** Unanimously approved.
- **Motion:** Request that funds not provided by TML Foundation be provided by the Town from the Chase Funds.  
**Result:** Unanimously approved.

### **B. Focus Groups:**

- The secretary has produced and distributed a worksheet consisting of a list of the Focus Groups outlined in the RFP.
- Committee members are to use this form to capture their thoughts on who might comprise each group and how we might go about approaching and/or gathering appropriate representation in each focus group, including comments to reflect reasons why.

### **New Business:**

#### **A. Barba & Wheelock letter to Chair:**

- The secretary sent a regrets letter to Barba & Wheelock approximately the same time they sent the letter to TMLSC Chair. No further correspondence is necessary.

**Meeting:** Our next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, June 19, 2008 @ 6:30 P.M.

**Adjournment:** 7:43 P.M.